



Position Paper 1 (updated): Controlled crying

First issued November 2013; revised March 2004; revised October 2013 © AAIMHI

The Australian Association for Infant Mental Health Inc. (AAIMHI) aims (in part) to improve professional and public recognition that infancy is a critical period in psycho-social development, and to work for the improvement of the mental health and development of all infants and families.

Definition

Crying is a signal of distress or discomfort (either psychological or physical), from an infant or young child to let the caregiver know that they need help. From an evolutionary perspective, crying promotes proximity to the primary caregiver, in the interest of survival and the development of social bonds (Bowlby, 1958).

Sleep problems occur when an infant's sleep behaviour is disturbing to their parents. Sleep problems may have a number of causes or associations including:

- infant temperament
- parental expectations related to lack of knowledge about infant crying and sleep patterns
- family stresses and relationship difficulties
- parental health issues, including depression
- lifestyle that focuses on infants sleeping in separate beds and/or room from parents
- underlying developmental problems (rare).

Controlled crying (also known as controlled comforting and sleep training) is a technique that is widely used as a way of managing parents' perceptions of sleep problems in infants and young children who do not settle alone or who wake at night. Controlled crying involves leaving the infant to cry for increasingly longer periods of time before providing comfort. The period of time rather than the infant's distress level is used to determine when to attend to the infant or toddler. The aim of controlled crying is to teach babies to settle themselves to sleep and to stop them from crying or calling out during the night.

Background to AAIMHI's concerns

AAIMHI is concerned that the widely practiced technique of controlled crying is not consistent with infants' and toddlers' needs for optimal emotional and psychological health and may have unintended negative consequences.

Attachment is the bond between parent (care-giver) and infant within which the infant feels secure to explore and learn and return to the care-giver for comfort. Attachment behaviours are those that children use to maintain closeness and include smiling, reaching out, crawling after the care-giver, vocalising and crying. Care-givers promote secure attachment by responding to infants' attachment behaviours. Care-givers who are sensitive to infants' needs and signals, affectionate, enjoy their children and are available and able to comfort their children, promote secure attachment and infant

well being. This kind of care-giving is important for children to make the most of all areas of their lives (Hertzman, 2000).

In the first few months of life babies need to have a parent or familiar adult nearby or available most of the time. In the early months of life unexplained and sometimes difficult to soothe crying exists across all cultures and may be seen to be a part of normal development. While this can be distressing for parents, they should be advised that this natural increase in crying peaks at around 6 to 8 weeks and generally settles by 3 to 4 months (Barr, 1998). Responsive parenting as well as holding and soothing of the infant during this sometimes difficult time will help the infant develop a sense of security and is the beginnings of secure attachment.

Although it is rare for this kind of crying to have a serious cause it is always important for parents who are worried about crying to have a health check for their baby.

Infants experience differing degrees of anxiety when separated from their parents. From early on, infants may express acute distress in the absence of a parent or when a parent leaves the room. Going to bed is a time of separation. When infants or toddlers cry upon separation it is a signal that they may be struggling with this process and need reassurance. An increase in separation anxiety often coincides with the infant's increasing mobility and may be linked to the infant's recognition that things and people exist when they are out of sight and that he or she can initiate movement away from the parent. Infants whose parents respond promptly and empathically to their crying learn to settle as they become secure in the knowledge that their needs for emotional comfort will be met (Bell & Ainsworth, 1972). This anxiety continues until the infant has a core understanding of the concept that his or her parents will return and he or she is safe. Almost all children grow out of the need to wake at night and signal parents for reassurance by three or four years of age and many much earlier.

The demands of modern life and some currently available parenting advice have led to an expectation that all infants and toddlers should sleep through the night from the early months or even weeks.

The fact is that infants normally have short sleep cycles which can cause them to arouse more often in the night than older children or adults. These short sleep cycles allow infants to experience more rapid eye movement (REM) sleep, which is considered to be important for their brain development (NCSDR, viewed 7/6/13).

There are various times in a child's development (illness, absence, major changes) when children need more assistance to settle than at other times. Family events that are distressing for the infant or toddler may lead to a need for more reassurance than in non-stressful times (Slavitz & Perry, 2010). To deny reassurance during these times would be distressing and may have a negative psychological impact. Research has shown that too much stress is harmful to infants (Perry & Pollard, 1998) but it is unclear how much is too much.

There have been recent studies (Middlemiss et al., 2011; Price et al., 2012) on the effect of controlled crying on infants, which have shown varying results. One study has attempted to address the long-term impact of controlled crying but the methodology does not justify the conclusion that there are no harmful impacts on infants (*Sleep training not harmful? Methodological concerns question conclusion*, 2013). No studies on controlled crying that we have reviewed stand up to rigorous scrutiny.

A recent study (Middlemiss et al., 2011) of infants and mothers admitted to a parenting centre found that when babies between the ages of 4 to 10 months were subjected to a sleep training program that was based on controlled crying, the crying decreased over three days. Initially when infants expressed distress in response to the sleep transition, mother and infant cortisol responses were elevated synchronously. On the third day of the program, however, results showed that the babies became quieter, no longer expressing distress during the sleep transition but their cortisol levels remained elevated. Without the infants' distress cue, mothers' cortisol levels decreased. While the babies no longer exhibited crying behaviours, elevated stress hormones *indicated that they remained psychologically distressed*. (It should be noted that this research was conducted at a parenting centre and not in the natural surrounds of the home). AAIMHI is concerned that although controlled crying may stop infants and toddlers from crying it may also have the effect of teaching children not to seek or expect support despite remaining internally distressed.

Many infants and parents sleep best when they sleep together, either co-sleeping on separate sleep surfaces (a cot near the bed) or bed sharing – sleeping in the same bed. There is no developmental reason why infants should sleep separately from their parents (McKenna & McDada, 2005). There are certain conditions however when sharing a sleep surface with an infant must be avoided:

- when the infant shares the sleep surface with a smoker.
- where there is adult clothing, bedding, doonas or pillows that may cover the infant.
- where the infant can be trapped between the wall and bed, can fall out of bed or could be rolled on.
- when the parent is under the influence of alcohol or drugs that cause sedation or is overly tired.
- where infants are sharing beds with other children or pets.
- where the infant is placed to sleep (either alone or with parents) on a sofa, beanbag, waterbed or sagging mattress.

Parents should check current information about safe sleeping; see *Sids and Kids*, Victoria (viewed 1/6/13) for more information.

It is important to note that there are no long term health or developmental problems caused by babies waking at night (St James-Roberts, 2008).

AAIMHI's position - Controlled crying principles

It is normal and healthy for infants and young children to wake through the night and to need attention from parents. This need not be labelled a disorder. There are no long term health or developmental problems caused by babies waking at night. Responding to an infant's needs/crying will not cause a lasting 'habit' but it will contribute to the infant's sense of security.

There is a wide variation in how quickly infants and toddlers 'sleep through the night'. Early and realistic information about what to expect and ways to settle infants may help parents understand their infant's state of mind and appropriately engage with their infant's sleeping patterns. When concerns are raised by parents about sleeping difficulties, a full professional assessment of the child's health, and child and family relationships should be undertaken. This should include:

- an assessment of whether in fact the infant's crying is outside normal levels.
- an understanding of experiences of isolation and frustration felt by many parents of infants and young children.

- an assessment of any other family difficulties (including post-natal depression) that may impact on parents' ability to respond to a crying child.

This assessment may then lead to appropriate referral allowing parents to access social supports and possible therapeutic intervention.

Any methods used to assist parents to get a good night's sleep should not compromise the infant's developmental and emotional needs. Controlled crying is not appropriate for use before the baby has a real understanding of the meaning of the parent's words; the infant or toddler needs to know that the parent will return and needs to feel safe when the parent is absent.

Most children by the age of about three have a good sense of self, are able to be more-or-less self sufficient with an abating separation anxiety so they may understand and cope with being left alone at bedtime for short periods, knowing that parents will return as required. Observing infants and toddlers and responding to their cues is the best way to assess when they feel safe to sleep alone.

Waking in older infants and toddlers may be due to separation anxiety. In situations where an infant or toddler has already experienced separation from a parent (e.g. due to sickness, hospitalisation, parental absence, out of home care or following adoption) he or she may easily become very distressed at sleep time, that is, at times of perceived separation. These infants and toddlers are more vulnerable to the stress caused by controlled crying. Sleeping with or in the same room as a parent is a valid option, enabling all to get a good night's sleep.

The controlled crying method has not been rigorously assessed in terms of the impact on the infant's emotional development. Other strategies, apart from controlled crying, should always be discussed with parents as preferable options.

References

- Barr R (1998). Colic and crying syndromes in infants. *Pediatrics* Vol. 102 No. Supplement E1, pp. 1282 -1286.
- Bell SM and Ainsworth MD (1972). Infant crying and maternal responsiveness. *Child Development* 43, 1171-1190.
- Bowlby J (1958). The nature of the child's tie to his mother. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 39, 350-373.
- McKenna J and McDada T (2005). Why babies should never sleep alone: A review of the co-sleeping controversy in relation to SIDS, bed sharing and breast feeding. *Paediatric Respiratory Reviews* 6 (2).
- Hertzman C (2000). The case for an early childhood developmental strategy. Isuma. *Canadian Journal of Policy Research* 1(2), 11-18
- Middlemiss W et al. (2011). Asynchrony of mother-infant hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis activity following extinction of infant crying responses induced during the transition to sleep. *Early Human Development* 63(4), 227-232.
- Perry BD and Pollard R (1998). Homeostasis, stress, trauma, and adaptation: a neurodevelopmental view of childhood trauma. *Child and Adolescent Psychiatric Clinics of North America* 7, 33-51.
- Price A et al. (2012). Outcomes at six years of age for children with infant sleep problems: Longitudinal community-based study. *Sleep Medicine* 13 (8), 991-998.
- Sids and Kids Victoria. <http://www.dhs.vic.gov.au/cpmanual/practice-context/children-in-specific-circumstances/1013-sudden-infant-death-sids-and-safe-sleeping-arrangements/3> viewed (1/6/13).

National Center on Sleep Disorders Research (NCSDR) *Sleep and early brain development and plasticity*.
National Sleep Disorders Research Plan: Section6. *Pediatrics*.
http://www.nhlbi.nih.gov/health/prof/sleep/res_plan/section6/section6.html

Sleep Training Not Harmful? Methodological concerns question conclusion (2013).
<http://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/130/4/643/reply#content> viewed 1/6/13.

St James-Roberts I (2008). Infant crying and sleeping: Helping parents to prevent and manage problems.
Primary Care Clinics in Office Practice 35, 547-567.

Szalavitz M and Perry BD (2010). *Born for love: Why empathy is essential and endangered*. William Morrow,
New York.

Bibliography

Brazelton TB (1992). *Touchpoints: Your child's emotional and behavioural development*. Reading, Mass. Addison-Wesley.

Dewar G (2008). *Baby sleep patterns: a guide for the science minded parent*.
<http://www.parentingscience.com/baby-sleep-patterns.html>

Lieberman A (1993). *The Emotional Life of the Toddler*. New York: Free Press.

Daws D (1993). *Through the Night: helping parents and sleepless infants*. New York: Basic Books.

Leach P (1994). *Children First: What we must do, and are not doing— for our children today*. London: Penguin.

Suggested reading for alternatives to controlled crying

Fleiss PM, Hodges FM and Phil D (2000). *Sweet Dreams: A Pediatrician's Secrets for Your Child's Good Night's Sleep*. Los Angeles: Lowell House.

Gethin A and Macgregor B (2012). *Helping Your Baby to Sleep: 2nd ed*. Sydney: Finch.

Hope M (1996). *For Crying Out Loud! Understanding and Helping Crying Babies*. Randwick NSW: Sydney Children's Hospital.

McKay P (2002). *100 Ways to Calm the Crying*. Melbourne: Lothian.

McKay P (2002). *Parenting by Heart*. Melbourne: Lothian.

MDConsult.com has a comprehensive article on infant crying and sleeping

Pantley E (2002). *The No-Cry Sleep Solution*. New York: Contemporary Books.

Sears W and Sears M (1999). *Parenting the fussy baby and high-need child: everything you need to know-- from birth to age five*. Boston: Little, Brown and Company.

Sears W and Sears M (2003). *The Baby Book: Everything you need to know about your baby – from birth to age two*. New York: Little, Brown and Company.

Sears W (2007). *Nighttime Parenting: How to Get Your Baby and Child to Sleep*. Plume.

Tracey N et al. (2002). *Sleep for Baby and Family*. Sydney: PIFA. Tel: 02 82301646.

A wide range of articles can be found at:

<http://www.naturalchild.org/>

<http://www.askdrsears.com/>

<http://evolutionaryparenting.com/what-you-need-to-know-about-crying-it-out/> Includes critique of controlled crying research.

Please note: While AAIMHI suggests the above websites for reading about sleep and controlled crying AAIMHI does not have an opinion on any other material on the websites.

Further Reading on crying and sleep

- Blurton Jones N (1972). Comparative aspects of mother-child contact. In: Blurton Jones N (Ed). *Ethological Studies of Child Behaviour*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bowlby J (1973). *Attachment and loss: 2. Separation*. Harmondsworth, Middlesex: Penguin.
- Dolby R (1996). Overview of Attachment: Theory and Consequences for Emotional Development. In: *Seminar 15. Attachment: Children's Emotional Development and the Link with Care and Protection Issues*. Sydney: Child Protection Council.
- Higley E and Dozier M (2009). *Night-time maternal responsiveness and infant attachment at one year*. *Attachment and Human Development*. 11 (4), 347-363.
- Hiscock H and Jordan B (2004). Problem crying in infancy. *Medical Journal of Australia* 118, 9 507-512.
- Hope MJ (1986). *Selected Paper No. 43: Understanding Crying in Infancy*. Kensington, NSW: Foundation for Child & Youth Studies.
- James McKenna's Mother-Baby Behavioural Sleep Laboratory. <http://www3.nd.edu/~jmckenn1/lab/>
- Keller H et al. (1996). Psychobiological aspects of infant crying. *Early Development and Parenting* 5, 1-13.
- Lampton Commons M and Miller PM. Emotional learning in infants: A cross-cultural examination. http://www.naturalchild.org/research/emotional_learning_infants.html
- McKenna J (2000). Cultural Influences on Infant Sleep (abbreviated chapter) *Zero To Three* 20, 9-18.
- Mindell J (2006) Behavioral treatment of bedtime problems and night wakings in infants and young children. *Sleep*, 29, 10.
- Odent M (1986). *Primal health: A blueprint for our survival*. London: Century Hutchinson.
- Perry BD. Memories of Fear: How the Brain Stores and Retrieves Physiologic States, Feelings, Behaviors and Thoughts from Traumatic Events. <http://www.childtrauma.org/>
- Oberlander T (2005). Post-Partum Depression and Infant Crying Behaviour. University of British Columbia, CANADA <http://www.child-encyclopedia.com/documents/OberlanderANGxp.pdf>
- Sears W. Science says excessive crying could be harmful <http://www.askdrsears.com/topics/fussy-baby/science-says-excessive-crying-could-be-harmful>
- Teti D et al. (2010.) Maternal emotional availability at bedtime predicts infant sleep quality. *Journal of Family Psychology* 24(3), 307-315.
- Trevathan W and McKenna J (1994). Evolutionary environments of human birth and infancy: Insights to apply to contemporary life. *Children's Environments* 11, 88-104.
- The Period of PURPLE Crying: <http://purplecrying.info>